

1. APPENDIX A

The coefficients of characteristic equation $\lambda^6 + p_1\lambda^5 + p_2\lambda^4 + p_3\lambda^3 + p_4\lambda^2 + p_5\lambda + p_6 = 0$, in Proposition 3.1 are obtained as follows.

$$p_1 = B + C + \xi + \gamma + 6m, \quad (1.1)$$

$$p_2 = (\xi + \gamma + 5m)(B + C) + BC + \xi\gamma + 5\xi m + 5\gamma m + 15m^2 + F, \quad (1.2)$$

$$\begin{aligned} p_3 = & (\xi + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m) + (\xi + m)(\gamma + m)(\alpha_1 + m) + (\xi + m)(\gamma + m)(\alpha_2 + m) \\ & + (\xi + m)(\gamma + m)(\alpha_3 + m) + ((\gamma + m)(B + m)(\alpha_1 + m) - \beta\phi\delta_1 S_0\alpha_1\eta_1) \\ & + ((\gamma + m)(B + m)(\alpha_2 + m) - \beta\phi\delta_1 S_0\alpha_2\eta_2) + (\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_2 + m)(\alpha_3 + m) \\ & + ((\gamma + m)(B + m)(\alpha_3 + m) - \beta\phi\delta_1 S_0\alpha_3\eta_3) + (B + m)(\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_2 + m) \\ & + (B + m)(\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_3 + m), \end{aligned} \quad (1.3)$$

$$\begin{aligned} p_4 = & (\xi + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m)(\alpha_1 + m) + (\xi + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m)(\alpha_2 + m) \\ & + (\xi + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m)(\alpha_3 + m) + (\xi + m)(B + m)(\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_2 + m) \\ & + (\xi + m)(B + m)(\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_3 + m) + (\xi + m)(B + m)(\alpha_2 + m)(\alpha_3 + m) \\ & + (\gamma + m)(B + m)(\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_2 + m) + (\gamma + m)(B + m)(\alpha_2 + m)(\alpha_3 + m) \\ & + (B + m)(\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_2 + m)(\alpha_3 + m) + (\gamma + m)(\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_2 + m)(\alpha_3 + m) \\ & + (\xi + m)(\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_2 + m)(\alpha_3 + m) + (\xi + m)(\gamma + m)(\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_2 + m) \\ & + (\xi + m)(\gamma + m)(\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_3 + m) + (\xi + m)(\gamma + m)(\alpha_2 + m)(\alpha_3 + m) \\ & - \beta\phi\delta_1 S_0\alpha_1\eta_1(\xi + m) - \beta\phi\delta_1 S_0\alpha_2\eta_2(\xi + m) \\ & - \beta\phi\delta_1 S_0\alpha_3\eta_3(\xi + m) - \beta\gamma\phi\delta_2 S_0\alpha_1\eta_1 - \beta\gamma\phi\delta_2 S_0\alpha_2\eta_2 \\ & - \beta\gamma\phi\delta_2 S_0\alpha_3\eta_3 - \beta\delta_1 S_0\phi\alpha_1\eta_1(\alpha_2 + m) - \beta\delta_1 S_0\phi\alpha_1\eta_1(\alpha_3 + m) - \beta\delta_1 \\ & \times S_0\phi\alpha_2\eta_2(\alpha_1 + m) - \beta\delta_1 S_0\phi\alpha_2\eta_2(\alpha_3 + m) - \beta\delta_1 S_0\phi\alpha_3\eta_3(\alpha_1 + m) \\ & - \beta\delta_1 S_0\phi\alpha_3\eta_3(\alpha_2 + m), \end{aligned} \quad (1.4)$$

$$\begin{aligned}
p_5 = & (\xi + m)(\gamma + m)(\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_2 + m)(\alpha_3 + m) + (\xi + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m) \\
& \times (\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_2 + m) + (\xi + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m)(\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_3 + m) + (\xi + m) \\
& \times (B + m)(\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_2 + m)(\alpha_3 + m) + (\xi + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m)(\alpha_2 + m) \\
& \times (\alpha_3 + m) + (\xi + m)(B + m)(\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_2 + m)(\alpha_3 + m) - \beta \delta_2 S_0 \gamma \phi \alpha_1 \eta_1 \\
& \times (\alpha_2 + m) - \beta \delta_2 S_0 \phi \gamma \alpha_1 \eta_1 (\alpha_3 + m) - \beta \delta_2 S_0 \gamma \phi \alpha_2 \eta_2 (\alpha_1 + m) \\
& - \beta \delta_2 S_0 \gamma \phi \alpha_2 \eta_2 (\alpha_3 + m) - \beta \delta_2 S_0 \gamma \phi \alpha_3 \eta_3 (\alpha_1 + m) - \beta \delta_2 S_0 \gamma \phi \alpha_3 \eta_3 (\alpha_2 + m) \\
& - \beta \delta_1 S_0 \phi \alpha_1 \eta_1 (\xi + m)(\alpha_2 + m) - \beta \delta_1 S_0 \phi \alpha_1 \eta_1 (\xi + m)(\alpha_3 + m) \\
& - \beta \delta_1 S_0 \phi \alpha_1 \eta_1 (\alpha_2 + m)(\alpha_3 + m) - \beta \delta_1 S_0 \phi \alpha_2 \eta_2 (\xi + m)(\alpha_1 + m) \\
& - \beta \delta_1 S_0 \phi \alpha_2 \eta_2 (\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_3 + m) - \beta \delta_1 S_0 \phi \alpha_3 \eta_3 (\xi + m)(\alpha_1 + m) \\
& - \beta \delta_1 S_0 \phi \alpha_3 \eta_3 (\xi + m)(\alpha_2 + m) - \beta \delta_1 S_0 \phi \alpha_3 \eta_3 (\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_2 + m) \\
& - \beta \delta_1 S_0 \phi \alpha_2 \eta_2 (\xi + m)(\alpha_3 + m),
\end{aligned} \tag{1.5}$$

$$p_6 = (m + \alpha_1)(m + \alpha_2)(m + \alpha_3)(\gamma + m)(\xi + m)(B + m)(1 - R_0). \tag{1.6}$$

Parameters B, D, E and G are defined in (3.3)-(3.6) and

$$\begin{aligned}
C &= \alpha_1 + \alpha_2 + \alpha_3, \\
S_0 &= \frac{L}{m}, \\
F &= \alpha_1 \alpha_2 + \alpha_1 \alpha_3 + \alpha_2 \alpha_3.
\end{aligned}$$

The basic reproduction number R_0 can be written as follows:

$$\begin{aligned}
R_0 = & \frac{\beta \delta_1 S_0 \phi \alpha_1 \eta_1}{(\alpha_1 + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m)} + \frac{\beta \delta_1 S_0 \phi \alpha_2 \eta_2}{(\alpha_2 + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m)} \\
& + \frac{\beta \delta_1 S_0 \phi \alpha_3 \eta_3}{(\alpha_3 + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m)} + \frac{\beta \delta_2 S_0 \phi \gamma \alpha_1 \eta_1}{(\alpha_1 + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m)(\xi + m)} \\
& + \frac{\beta \delta_2 S_0 \phi \gamma \alpha_2 \eta_2 (m^2 + \alpha_1 m + \alpha_3 m)}{(\alpha_1 + m)(\alpha_2 + m)(\alpha_3 + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m)(\xi + m)} \\
& + \frac{\beta \delta_2 S_0 \phi \gamma \alpha_3 \eta_3}{(\alpha_3 + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m)(\xi + m)}.
\end{aligned}$$

Since $R_0 < 1$, we have

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{\beta \delta_1 S_0 \phi \alpha_1 \eta_1}{(\alpha_1 + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m)} &< 1, \\ \frac{\beta \delta_1 S_0 \phi \alpha_2 \eta_2}{(\alpha_2 + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m)} &< 1 \\ \frac{\beta \delta_1 S_0 \phi \alpha_3 \eta_3}{(\alpha_3 + m)(\gamma + m)(B + m)} &< 1.\end{aligned}$$

Hence $p_3 > 0$. Similar to the above discussion, it can be shown that $p_4 > 0$, $p_5 > 0$. It is clear, the inequality $\Delta_1 = p_1 > 0$ holds. Δ_3 and Δ_5 are obtained from the following relationship:

$$\begin{aligned}\Delta_3 &= p_3(p_1 p_2 - p_3) + p_1(p_5 - p_1 p_4), \\ \Delta_5 &= p_1^2 p_2 p_5 p_6 + p_1^2 p_3 p_4 p_6 - p_1^2 p_4^2 p_5 \\ &\quad - p_1 p_2^2 p_5^2 - p_1 p_2 p_3^2 p_6 + p_1 p_2 p_3 p_4 p_5 \\ &\quad - p_1^2 p_6^2 + p_1 p_2 p_5 p_6 - 2 p_1 p_3 p_5 p_6 \\ &\quad + 2 p_1 p_4 p_5^2 + p_2 p_3 p_5^2 + p_3^3 p_6 - p_3^2 p_4 p_5 \\ &\quad - p_3 p_5 p_6 - p_5^3.\end{aligned}$$

By using simple but long calculations, the inequalities $\Delta_3 > 0$ and $\Delta_5 > 0$ hold. To prove this proposition, we have used Liénard and Chipart and Routh-Hurwitz stability criterion which are stated below.

Definition 1.1. *The Routh-Hurwitz stability criterion states that for a system having a characteristic equation as follows:*

$$P_n(\lambda) = p_0 \lambda^n + p_1 \lambda^{n-1} + \dots + p_{n-1} \lambda + p_n.$$

The Matrix

$$H_n = \begin{pmatrix} p_1 & p_0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & \vdots & 0 \\ p_3 & p_2 & p_1 & p_0 & 0 & 0 & \vdots & 0 \\ p_5 & p_4 & p_3 & p_2 & p_1 & p_0 & \vdots & 0 \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & \vdots & p_n \end{pmatrix}.$$

is called the Hurwitz matrix, associated with $P_n(\lambda)$. The main diagonal of the matrix contains elements $p_1, p_2, \dots, p_n$. The first column contains numbers with odd indices $p_1, p_3, p_5, \dots$. In each row, the index of each following number (counting from left to right) is less than the index of its predecessor. All other coefficients with indices greater than n or less than 0 are replaced by zeros. To be asymptotically stable of system, all the principal minors of the H_n must be

positive where the principle minors are as follows:

$$\begin{aligned}\Delta_1 &= |p_1| \\ \Delta_2 &= \begin{vmatrix} p_1 & p_0 \\ p_3 & p_2 \end{vmatrix} \\ \Delta_3 &= \begin{vmatrix} p_1 & p_0 & 0 \\ p_3 & p_2 & p_1 \\ p_5 & p_4 & p_3 \end{vmatrix} \\ &\vdots \\ \Delta_n &= |H_n|.\end{aligned}$$

Note 2.1: It can still be difficult to calculate these determinants; however, Liénard and Chipart showed that if all the coefficients in the characteristic equation are positive ($a_i > 0$ for $i = 1, \dots, n$) then the system is asymptotically stable if either

- $\Delta_1 > 0, \Delta_3 > 0, \dots$

or

- $\Delta_2 > 0, \Delta_4 > 0, \dots$