Resettlement Action Plan of Lagos Red Rail Line and Project Affected Persons’ (Paps) Perception

Abolaji Atobatele (abolaji.atobatele@covenantuniversity.edu.ng)
Covenant University

Ahmed Moliki
Covenant University

Oluwatimilehin Deinde-Adedeji
Covenant University

Moyosoluwa Dele-Dada
Covenant University

Research Article

Keywords: Lagos State, Government, transportation, Red Rail Line, Project Affected Persons, Properties

Posted Date: June 5th, 2023

DOI: https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.rs-2984903/v1

License: This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License. Read Full License
Abstract

This study emphasizes on the project affected persons and their perception concerning the activities of government in Lagos State. Lagos Red Rail Line is going to be a laudable project that will result in socio-economic development of the State and reduce traffic jam when completed. The study employed survey research technique which include administration of interview to the respondents through focus group discussion in Ikeja, Yaba, Mushin and Oyingbo and secondary source of data such as Journals, Internet, Government Gazette, and Magazines. The study reveals that lack of confidence in government coupled with high rate of illiteracy is responsible to the negative reaction of the project affected persons. The study therefore recommends that government at all levels in Lagos State and Nigeria at large should build the confidence of the residents in the State and Nigeria by fulfilling the promises made to residents of Lagos State and Nigerians before and after the elections.

1.0 Background to the Study

A good transportation system is a key to the growth and development of any society. A good transport system include modern Rail System, Bus Rapid Transit (BRT), Airplane, Ship and Motorized canoe. Apart from conveying passengers from one place to another for social and economic purposes, their presence provides aesthetic to the society where they are cited. The importance of a good transportation system cannot be over emphasized as it contributes to the development of London and some other Cities around the world. Also the presence of Airport and Seaport in Ikeja and Apapa in Nigeria contributed tremendously to the growth and development of those Areas and Lagos State at large. More so, the construction of BRT Lane and Bus Stops result to the beautification and growth of the areas where they are cited. The heavy construction of transportation network system in Lagos State has made the State the hub of Nigeria commercial and economic activities.

According to the Economist Special Report on Nigeria (2015) Lagos State being the largest city in Sub-Saharan Africa is the Nigeria's commercial hub with a metropolitan area population growth rate put around 17 million in 2015, with a growth rate at 4% per year.

Adeniran and Yusuf (2016) affirm that, there is a nexus between transport system and socio-economic changes. They went further to say movement of people, load and level of territorial accessibility are the main thrust of this relationship which create economic opportunities as a result of transportation infrastructure.

Also Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) (2014) reports that a detailed master plan of Lagos on transport system was accomplished in 1980 with year 2000 as its target year. This master plan was reviewed in year 2005 by John Asiyangbi Associates and report that, the master plan that covers individual districts have been instituted and these master plans generically is between year 2010 to 2030. Also the master plan for Lagos Metropolitan Area instituted in December 2009 was concerned with the development of Lagos Rail Transits (LRT) Bus Rapid Transit (BRT), Water transport system and Road
system as its year of target. In year 2013, there was an introduction of an amendment master plan which has a final report accomplished in year 2014. The amended master plan has its target year as 2032 with seven-point agenda which inter alia are road and public transportation network plan, logistic plan, non-motorized transport plan, traffic safety plan, climate change plan, economic analysis and proposal of systems (JICA, 2014).

Also, the assessment system for upper-level development programme for Lagos State and the safeguards policy which were designed by Lagos State Metropolitan Area Transport Authority (LAMATA) that is saddled with the responsibility of implementing LRT were reviewed. There was a pre-evaluations for the LRT blue line and red line whose construction is on-going.

However, Red Line Rail is sponsored by the Lagos State government via LAMATA and assisted by World Bank to improve transport system in the state.

According to Business Day (2020) the long-proposed Lagos Red Line Rail system will kick-start in October 2022, the red line is one of the seven lines proposed in Lagos strategic transport master plan for the mobility of commuters and reduction in grid lock which characterize the State.

However embarking on this project connotes that many properties on the right of way will be affected. In order words, the owners of these affected properties will definitely lose them to the government which will affect their social, economic and psychological life.

Regardless the methods used by the government to acquire peoples’ properties, resettlement in most cases causes emotional trauma, untold hardship and disaster in Africa (Cemea, Jackson & Sleigh, Jibril quoted in Agba, Ogaboh, Akpanudoedehe, and Ushie, 2010).

Resettlement leads to community displacement and increase risks of being pauperized by destroying cultural practice, system and way of existences (Cemea, Tan & Yao quoted in Agba, et al, 2010).

ADB, (2014) asserts that compensation should be paid to both title and non-legal ownership, also the groups whose properties are affected, squatters and encroachers whose structures, crops and other assets are destroyed as a result of relocation should equally be compensated adequately.

Ramanathan and Geetha (1998) affirm that Social Economic Impact Assessment of large industrial projects is laudable with a social implication because these projects are liable to affect the socio-economic activities of people, referred to as project-affected people (PAP). It is against this background that this study seeks to examine the impact assessment studies on Lagos Red Rail Line Project and Perception of Project Affected Persons, (PAPs).

2.0 Literature Review

Many studies have been carried out on transport system and resettlement of project affected persons. Hence this study shall review the literature to see the extent of the project and the reaction of the project
Affected persons (PAPs) on the project.

JICA (2014) carried out a study on the “Second Data collection survey on the Mass Rapid Transit in the Federal Republic of Nigeria”. The study reveals that the project evaluation indicators have not been sufficiently examined. The study therefore recommends that sequel to this finding; it has become necessary to garner information that will underpin the development through research.

Adeniran and Yusuf (2016) conducted a research on “Transportation and National Development: Emphasis to Nigeria”. The study finds out that transportation infrastructure will result to economic opportunities. This study recommends that in order to achieving sustainable development, adequate and detailed measures be taken.

Abioye, Shubber and Koenigsberger (2016) carried out a study in evaluating the “Role and Impact of Railway Transport in the Nigerian Economy, options and choices: A Case of Nigerian Railway Corporation”. The study reveals that Nigerian Railway Corporation is confronted with myriads of problem which include dwindling revenue, increasing operational cost and mounting debt. The study therefore request for the private running of the railway.

Wujuade (2016) carried out a research on “Potentials of Lights Rail Transit in Nigeria”. The study points out that light rail transit will help to reduce congestion since it has high passengers’ capacity. The study therefore recommends that an effective rail system can be achieved through public private partnership.

Arndt, Morgan, Overman, Clower, Weinstein, & Seman (2009) conducted a study on “Transportation, Social and Economic Impact of Light and Commuter Rail. The study finds out that almost all the federal funding emanates from the U.S. Department of transportation. Blanquist & Koning (2017) conducted a research on the “Local Economic impacts of High-Speed Railways. Theories and Facts”. The study identifies both the presence and absence of HSR impacts, whether they are long-term effects on the relocation of households, businesses and ultimately local growth patterns, or the short-term effects on production and consumption of local regions. Arising from the findings of this study, it was discovered that the key challenge is being able to empirically determine to what extent new infrastructures have influenced changes in the field and not the other way round.

Robinson (2003) carried out a research on “Risks and Rights: The Causes, Consequences and Challenges of Development-Induced Displacement”. The study finds out that government and organizations violate operational directives on involuntary resettlement as well as many social and environmental policies including the indigenous people’s policy. The study therefore recommends that the representative of the Secretary-General and IDP unit should conduct field missions to countries where development-induced displacement is problematic.

Saidu (2009) conducted a study on “An Analysis of Loko Flood Disaster Resettlement Scheme in Song Local Government Area of Adamawa State, Nigeria”. A simple random sampling technique was used to interview 280 household heads by administering a questionnaire to each. The study finds out that the
project has not been successful after 19 years of its operation as a result of government failure to identify the needs and hopes and preferences of the victims. The study therefore recommends that scheme beneficiaries should be adequately compensated for the loss of properties. The methodology of this study is ambiguous, needs clarification.

Amnesty International (2014) conducted a study on “At the Mercy of the Government Violation of the Right to an Effective Remedy in Badia East, Lagos State, Nigeria”. The study finds out that, community representatives involved in the RAP discussion from 28th April to 9 May, 2013 told Amnesty International that entitlement matrix was returned to the affected people for consultation as many affected people considered the compensation inadequate for the losses suffered. The study therefore recommends that World Bank should synergize with the Government of Lagos State in order to address the problems identified.

Somalia Regional Corridors Infrastructure Programme (N.D) conducts a research on “Resettlement Action Plan”. The study finds out that Somalia legal requirement is in consonance with the AFDB guidelines in the sense that both parties require fair compensation for the affected persons and set legal framework to resolve conflicts emanating from the lowest level of the court of law. The study recommends that for smooth land acquisition there should be involvement of local leadership most especially Tribal Administration and Country Officials when selecting sites for public infrastructures.

Agba, Akpanudoedehe and Ushie (2010) carried out a study on “Socio-Economic and cultural Impacts of Resettlements on Bakassi People of Cross River State, Nigeria”. The study used a survey research technique in which questionnaires were purposively administered to Bakassi resettlement site at Ekpiri Ikang in Cross River State. The study reveals that there is significant relationship between Bakassi resettlement and their occupations, culture and inhabitation pattern. The study recommends that affected persons should be adequately compensated.

2.1 Insight into Resettlement and its Cultural, Social and Economic Implications on Project Affected Persons.

Resettlement is not expected but it comes often times either naturally or man-made. Resettlement can occur as a result of natural disaster such as flood, earthquake etc. The man-made happens due to construction of bridges, roads, rail line etc. The effect of resettlement on project affected persons can be grave as it affects the cultural, psychological, economic and social status either positively or negatively. According to Agba et al (2010) there is frequent occurrence of resettlement in real life such that it causes major economic losses and cultural disruption to the affected persons.

The government of Nigeria displaced over 250,000 people who were the real indigene of Abuja as result of acquisition of about 800 square kilometer of land for the relocation of federal capital territory (FCT) to Abuja. This affected the place of cultural heritage of this people and other socio-economic activities.
Jubril (2006) opines that, this resettlement is responsible for infrastructural inadequacies and land administration problems in FCT.

Olawepo (2008) explains that despite the positive social change in Jebba resettlement, most families lost their jobs, customers, clients and other socio-economic activities.

2.2. Insight into Resettlement Action Plan Objectives.

As posited by the Edo State World Bank Assisted Nigeria Erosion and Watershed Management Project (EDO-NEWMAP, 2017), the main aim of the Resettlement Action Plan (RAP) is to avoid problems related to resettlement and also considers possible alternatives that can avert or curtail displacement. In situations where there are cases of land procurement and forced relocation is inevitable, the RAP takes care of the resettlement exercise and allocates adequate compensation. In addition, RAP is structured to identify and evaluate the human consequences of the proposed project, develop an action plan patterned after the World Bank policy and existing policies and regulations in Nigeria.

2.3 Insight into RAP Provisions as Describes in OP 4.12, Paragraphs 2 and 4 of the World Bank.

It is expected that a law made in respect of an exercise must have a set of procedure which must be adhered to strictly, hence these are the provision guiding the RAP Exercise.

- A brief project description and that identifies components that require land acquisition and resettlement as well as an explanation of the need for the Resettlement Action Plan.
- A Legal analysis and review of the Nigerian laws, regulations and bank policy requirements and steps to be taken to address the difference between them; including carrying the people along and declaration of the cut-off date;
- Estimate displacement population including various categories of displaced parties to a reasonable extent.
- Clearly state the criteria for eligibility of various types of displaced persons;
- A standard procedure for transactional costs for restoring livelihoods of previous settlers where they are adversely affected should be described;
- Organizational procedures for the delivery of entitlements, implementation of the resettlement process, linking resettlement planning and implementation to both civil works and livelihood strategies
- A standard process for grievances and redress that takes into consideration (a) grievances registration; (b) transparent and prompt action on grievances, (c) standard procedure (d) possibility for appeal; and (e) reducing legal proceedings to the barest minimum;
- A clear outline of the arrangements for resettlement funding resettlement as well as the preparation and review of cost estimates, disbursement and other emergency plans;
- A partnership should be developed to identify all the agencies, private and public that are parties to the resettlement process. Their various roles, allocation and the legal arrangements to be made;
• Involvement of the displaced persons in the planning, implementation and monitoring; and
• A detailed outline of monitoring, verification and evaluation process is required in the resettlement process (WEDO-NEWMAP, 2017).

2.3 Insight into Principles Guiding RAP

The following must be strictly adhered to in ensuring that RAP abides with approved international standards

• Resettlement must be avoided or minimized.
• There must be a genuine consultation
• There must be an established baseline data of those affected prior to resettlement.
• Assistance must be provided during relocation.
• Adequate compensation options must be negotiated
• Vulnerable social groups must be catered for
• Resettlement must take place as a development opportunity that ensures that PAPs benefit
• Resettlement must be seen as an upfront project cost.
• There should be an established procedure for independent monitoring and grievance place.
• Operational Procedure on forced Resettlement as outlined by World Bank must be adhered to (EDO-NEWMAP, 2017).

3.0 Methodology

This study employs both primary and secondary sources of data which include interview, Journals, publications, government gazette, Internet etc. The survey research design was employed which included structured interview administered to gather data from the project affected persons (PAPs) in Ikeja, Mushin, Oyingbo & Yaba. 23 respondents were purposively interviewed and were between 18 years old and above. The respondents include the property’s owners and the tenants of the affected properties in Lagos.

4.0 Findings and Discussions

Table 4.1 showing the analysis of interview response using Thematic Analysis
| Informant 1 | Property's owner | Oyingbo | Male | Trading | In1  |
| Informant 2 | Property's owner | Oyingbo | Female | Retiree | In2  |
| Informant 3 | Tenant | Oyingbo | Female | Trading | In3 |
| Informant 4 | Property's owner | Oyingbo | Male | Trading | In4 |
| Informant 5 | Tenant | Oyingbo | Male | Trading | In5 |
| Informant 6 | Tenant | Ikeja | Male | Trading | In6 |
| Informant 7 | Property's owner | Ikeja | Male | Railway Staff | In7 |
| Informant 8 | Tenant | Ikeja | Male | Trading | In8 |
| Informant 9 | Tenant | Ikeja | Male | Trading | In9 |
| Informant 10 | Tenant | Ikeja | Male | Trading | In10 |
| Informant 11 | Property's owner | Mushin | Male | Retiree | In11 |
| Informant 12 | Property's owner | Mushin | Male | Trading | In12 |
| Informant 13 | Tenant | Mushin | Female | Trading | In13 |
| Informant 14 | Tenant | Mushin | Male | Teaching | In14 |
| Informant 15 | Tenant | Mushin | Female | Trading | In15 |
| Informant 16 | Tenant | Yaba | Male | Trading | In16 |
| Informant 17 | Tenant | Yaba | Male | Trading | In17 |
| Informant 18 | Tenant | Yaba | Male | Trading | In18 |
| Informant 19 | Tenant | Yaba | Female | Trading | In19 |
| Informant 20 | Tenant | Yaba | Female | Trading | In20 |
| Informant 21 | Tenant | Yaba | Male | Trading | In21 |
| Informant 22 | Tenant | Yaba | Male | Trading | In22 |
| Informant 23 | Tenant | Yaba | Female | Trading | In23 |

Source: - Researcher Survey, 2021

Theme I: Proposed Project

Sub-Theme i: How did you see this proposed project?
The first theme developed is on the perception of the project affected persons. According to some informants: - “The project is laudable as it will bring development to Lagos”. “The project is good because it will reduce grid lock in the State”. The project will help us to reduce the grid lock”. This is a laudable project and it is going to be beneficial to Lagosians”. I am happy about the project but my fear is that will government complete this project at the stipulated time (In1, In4, In15, In20, and In22). In addition to the above explanation provided by some informants, other informants also stated that: - “the project is another way to embezzle taxpayer’s money”. “The government wants to inflict hardship on us”. “Wetin concern me with the project, make government give me loan make I add am to my market”. “My fear is that government is not sincere about their promises”. “it is a good project but the problem I have with this project is that government might not complete this project in the next 5 years”. “I have lost hope in this government because many people are living in abject poverty and the government want to build standard gauge. Of what importance is that?”. “It is a white elephant project”. “All this project is a way of stealing money”. “What is my business with the project? I have no car and how do you think I will benefit from the project”. “The project is another way to destroy our properties”. “I am not happy about this project because I am not going to be adequately compensated”. “I no get car and I know no how the project go benefit me”. “Make government give us money instead of this project”. “We don't need project, what we need is money” “How am I sure that the government will compensate for the destruction of my property”. “I am not interested in the project”. “Will government relocate me to another busy area?” The project will not last longer”. The project will increase the suffering of the people”. I no like this project because the government want use the project to campaign for the next election” (In2, In3, In5, In6, In7, In8, In9, In10, In11, In12, In13, In14, In16, In17, In18, In19, In21, & In23). From the above information, it shows clearly that there were mixed reactions about the project. It showed that majority of the respondents interviewed were not glad about the projects.

Theme II: Information about the project

Sub-Theme ii: How did you hear about the project?

The second theme developed is on the medium of getting the information:-

“The meeting was called yesterday by the officials of Lagos Metropolitan Area Transport (LAMATA) and we were briefed”. “I was in the meeting and we were told about the government plan”. “I was called upon by the officials of the LAMATA to the meeting”. “I was briefed about the time of the meeting.” I heard about the meeting on the grapevine and I attended the meeting” (In1, In17, ln11, ln15, In23). Some respondents stated that: - “I did not hear about the meeting not until I saw the enumerators performing their duties”. “Me, I no dey o and nobody tell me anything about the meeting”. “I did not hear about any meeting until I returned from work in the evening”. “I did not hear anything before now”. “I heard about the meeting when I was in my friend shop”. “I got to know about the meeting after the end of the meeting”. “I was not part of the meeting because I did not hear”. “Nobody told me anything about the meeting because I left the shop around past 8 yesterday”. “I left the shop around 1 pm yesterday perhaps that is the reason I did not hear information about the meeting”.” I heard about the meeting through our
chairman”. “I was not aware of the meeting until this morning” (In2, In4 In9, In12, In13, In14, In16, In19, In20, In21, In22). From the above information, it shows that majority of the respondents were not aware of the meeting, they only heard about the meeting after the conclusion of the meeting and the plan.

**Theme III: Perception of the people concerning government compensation**

**Sub-Theme iii: Do you think government is serious about compensating the project affected persons?**

The third theme developed is on the seriousness of government with respect to compensating the project affected persons. According to some informants: - “I don’t believe in the government of Nigeria because they are liars”. “The government just use compensation to deceive us so that they can collect our properties from us”. “Do you believe government lies? Nigeria government do not have anything to offer”. “Nigeria government is not reliable”. “I don’t have hope in this government even if the government will compensate us because their compensation cannot commensurate with the property destroyed” “Government will not pay anybody because government is not responsible to anybody”. “I have just paid N1.5 million for my shop to the landlord, how will government compensate me for this loss”. “If government is sure of its seriousness let him start paying us the compensation before taking our properties from us”. Government cannot pay me the exact amount I spent to buy this property, government is only lying”. Lagos State government will not do anything about the compensation”. Peanut amount of money will be given if at they want to pay (In7, In 9, In 10, In 14, In 15, In17, In18, In19, In20, In22, and In23). However some informants provided information such as: - “I believe in the government particularly the government of Sanwoolu” “I am hopeful that the Lagos State government will not renege on his promise” “I believe that I will be adequately compensated” “Government will not watch us suffer, he has made promise to us that he was going to compensate the landlords and the tenants”. “I believe that this administration will not renege on their promise” (In1, In2, In3, In6, In8). From the above information gather across the study areas, it shows that people don’t believe in government may be such projects have been initiated by the government in the past where government refused to compensate the affected persons.

**Theme IV: Information about Project Affected Persons**

**Sub-Theme IV: How did you feel when you were asked to give account of your property?**

The fourth theme developed is on the declaration of the project affected persons. According to some informant: - “I lied about the properties I have inside my house because I was afraid that government might use it to access my tax”. “If government was going to compensate me as promised, how will I get good sum of money?” “I was not sincere with the declaration because I was afraid that my property will be taxed”. I lied about my properties because I was told that government would compensate us”. In7, In 9, In 10, In 14, In 15, In17, In18, In19, In20, In22, and In23). “I did not feel any how because I am a tax payer and not afraid of declaration”. “I was sincere with the declaration because it is good to pay tax” (In1, In2, In3, In6, In8). From the above information harvested from the interviewees, there was mixed feelings
about the government the intention towards the people which informed the many respondents to lie about their status.

**There was no adequate consultation.** The time allocated for consultation was not adequate. The stakeholders in the affected areas which included the chairmen of Community Development Association, Opinion Leaders, Local Government Authorities etc. were invited to the meetings in which it was explained to them the plan and aspiration of the government with a directive that the representatives of each community should go home and disseminate the news to their members unfortunately, many affected persons weren’t aware of the development while some CDA chairmen failed to disseminate the information to their members for a reason best known to them. But in all, the time frame for the consultation was inadequate.

**Many people do not take government seriously.** The respondents were persuaded to give information about themselves but were reluctant because similar exercises have been carried out by the government which did not yield impacts. Many respondents believed that this exercise was just a charade, they will believe the government when the project is completed.

**Falsification of information.** Some respondents were afraid to give their information because they were of opinion that there information may be used to process their tax rate. While some gave false information about themselves which include, value of their properties, tenement rate, number of their children etc. they had.

**Loss of confidence in the exercise.** Some properties’ owners and tenants whose their properties were not affected wanted their properties to be enumerated at all cost because of the compensation involved while some people whose properties were affected refused to be enumerated.

**Lastly, there was mixed feelings.** Some respondents were of the view that, the project is not good because it is going to affect their socio-economic activities and properties negatively while some respondents believed that it is going to be a laudable project that will impact adequately on the socio-economic development of the State.

### 5.0 Recommendation and Conclusion

The study therefore recommends that government at various level should try as much as possible to build confidence in the people by doing the needful in terms of adhering to the rules of engagement that affect compensation and relocation of the project affected persons

Also, Nigerians need to be orientated about the values and patriotism so that in the future government engagement with the people, they will learn to be truthful when declaration is involved.
Government should ensure that more than 6 months’ notice are served to the people that may likely be affected by any projects with adequate compensation.

There should be punitive measures put on ground for any members of public found lying about their properties during the declarations.

The study concludes that this project is a laudable and promising as it is going to reduce the grid lock and increase economic and social lives of many residents of Lagos. However, many impact assessment exercises have been carried out in the past by the government which did not yield any positive results because of the irresponsible nature of Nigeria leadership coupled with large numbers of illiterate who do not know what the exercise is all about. Also the citizens were not left out of blame because many of them refused to declare their assets completely because of the fear that the government may use the information to assess their tax. Others declared fake information so that the government could compensate them adequately.

Declarations

Ethical Approval

Ethical Statement for Solid State Ionics

1) This material is the authors' own original work, which has not been previously published elsewhere.

2) The paper is not currently being considered for publication elsewhere.

3) The paper reflects the authors' own research and analysis in a truthful and complete manner.

4) The paper properly credits the meaningful contributions of co-authors and co-researchers.

5) The results are appropriately placed in the context of prior and existing research.

6) All sources used are properly disclosed (correct citation). Literally copying of text must be indicated as such by using quotation marks and giving proper reference.

7) All authors have been personally and actively involved in substantial work leading to the paper, and will take public responsibility for its content.

I agree with the above statements and declare that this submission follows the policies of Solid State Ionics as outlined in the Guide for Authors and in the Ethical Statement.

Date: 26/05/2023

A.J

Corresponding author’s signature:
Competing Interest

No, I declare that the authors have no competing interests as defined by Springer, or other interests that might be perceived to influence the results and/or discussion reported in this paper.

Author’s Contributions

Dr. Abolaji Atobatele wrote the body of the work, Dr Moliki, Mr Deinde-Adedeji and Miss Dele-Dada contributed in the review of the literature and collection of data from the respondents.

Funding

The Authors of this study recognize and appreciate the support given by the Covenant University Centre for Research, Innovation, and Development (CUCRID) in terms of financial supports in the course of publishing this study.

Availability of Data and Materials

The results/data/figures in this manuscript have not been published elsewhere, nor are they under consideration by another publisher.

References

2. ADB (2014) .REG: Mainstreaming Land Acquisition and Resettlement Safeguards in the Central and West Asian Region. Technical Assistance Consultant’s Report