Supplementary File S3

Participant Instructions, Writing Instruments, and Examples of CAF Coding

Participant instructions

Study Title:

Comparing Human Expert and LLM-Based Assessment in Evaluating Iranian EFL Learners' Writing: A Study on Accuracy, Consistency, and Learner Perceptions

Researcher: Amin Roshanaei – M.A. Candidate, Maragheh University

Supervisor: Dr. Salimi

Dear Participant,

You are invited to take part in a research study that compares the scoring of English essays by human experts and by artificial intelligence (AI) systems such as ChatGPT, Deepseek, and Gemini.

In this study, you will:

1. Write a argumentative essays in English on the given topic.

Your participation will help us understand how AI compares with human scoring in terms of accuracy, consistency, and fairness.

Instructions for Participants

- You will write two separate argumentative essays.
- Essay length: Minimum 200 words each.
- Write in English only.
- You may write by hand (clearly) or type on a computer.
- Please do not use AI tools or translation software when writing — this is to ensure results reflect your own writing skills.
- Place your Participant Code (not your name) at the top of each essay page.

Essay Topic

Do social media platforms help or harm real-life communication skills?

The original bilingual topic and consent section appear in the source document. The Persian translation is preserved below as a source image.

Essay:

Do social media platforms help or harm real-life communication skills?

(آن ها آسیب می زنند؟ کمک می کنند یا به آیا شبکه های اجتماعی به مهارت های ارتباطی در دنیای واقعی)

Agreement & Consent

- Your participation is **voluntary** and you may withdraw at any time.
- Your essays will be kept **anonymous** and used for **research purposes only**.
- Your academic grades will **not** be affected by participation or withdrawal.
- By signing below, you confirm that you understand the study and agree to participate.

Participant Code: _____

Full Name: _____

Signature: _____

Date: _____

Researcher Contact Information:

Email: Aminroshanaie@gmail.com

Session A — Essay Writing Sheet

Essay Writing Sheet

Name: ____

Participant Code: _____________

- -

Participant Code: ____________

Date: ________________________ Session: A

Essay Topic:

Do social media platforms help or harm real-life communication skills?

Minimum 200 word. Write your essay below.

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

Session B — Essay Writing Sheet

Essay Writing Sheet

Name: ____

Participant Code: _____________

- -

Participant Code: ____________

Date: ________________________ Session: B

Essay Topic:

Do social media platforms help or harm real-life communication skills?

Minimum 200 word. Write your essay below.

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

____

Participant A7 — Original Handwritten Essay

Essay Writing Sheet

Name: _____

Participant Code: A7

Participant Code: A7

Date: 1404, 9, 18 Session: A

Essay Topic:

Do social media platforms help or harm real-life communication skills?

Minimum 200 word. Write your essay below.

Social platforms have pro and cons in our real-life communication skills.

On the positive side, social media helps us stay in touch with family and friends who live far away, It allwes us to share life's everyday moments as well as big milestones in real time. It keeps us close, no matter the distance. We can celebrate a promotion, laugh at a silly pet video - all as if we were right there together.

On the other hand, it also has negative side. Talking online is different from talking face to face. On the social media, you can't see a person's face and you just hear their voice. This means we don't practice understanding real emotions. Also, people often look at their phone instead of talking to the person in front of them. This makes real conversation feel less important.

Social media has a huge effect. Ultimately, the outcome depends on your own choices to how use it in your communication.

Participant A7 — Reviewed Human CAF Coding

A7

Social platforms have pros and cons in our real-life communication skills.

On the positive side, social media helps us stay in touch with family and friends who live for away. it allows us to share life's every day moments as well as big milestones in real time. It keeps us close, no matter the distance. We can celebrate a promotion, laugh at silly pet videos all as if we were right there together.

On the other hand, it also has a negative side. Talking online is different from talking face-to-face. On the social media, you can't see a person's face and you just hear their voice, This means we don't practice understanding real emotions. Also, people often look at their phones instead of talking to the person in front of them.

This makes real conversation feel less important.

Social media has a huge effect. Ultimately, the outcome depends on your own choices on how to use it in your communication.

T- Tunit = 12
Snode = 28
T-word = 149
Error free Tunit = 6

$FI = \frac{149}{12} = 12,41$ $Ac = \frac{6}{12} = 0,5$ $cp = \frac{28}{12} = 2,33$

Rater 2 → ok
Rater 3 → ok

ChatGPT CAF Output — Participant 001, Essay 1

